Element	Outstanding	Failing
Purpose	 makes a clear and compelling statement-has a compelling title that helps to signal the central insight/argument of the analysis 	-does not make a coherent main point, and/or fails to show that the point is useful /interesting-has no title or a title with no relevant substance (e.g., "Analysis Assignment" or simply the title of the story you are writing about)
	-establishes a goal for the analysis early on and meets the expectations it sets for readers	-essay seems to be about one thing but then is really about something else
Reasoning (Evidence AND	-uses relevant evidence (quotes) from the story	-does not use any evidence, either in paraphrase or quote form, from the project, OR,
Analysis)	-makes good use of all evidence /quotes included, by showing readers what you think is most important and how the evidence/quote relates to the overall argument you are making	 -has some or lots of quotes but lacks explanation about why these quotes are relevant -reads like a description only; is largely a summary of the project and how it works and contains little or no analysis
	-avoids excessive summary, emphasizing analysis instead; when summary is used, you are summarizing according to what's most important and signaling your own position	
Order	-unfolds in a logical and convincing way -all pieces of the argument are connected back to the essay's main insight	 -essay lacks organization; it is hard to follow the argument -has some or even lots of insights but they are not connected to one another or to a central point
Audience	-written with an intelligent, interested audience in mind, with collegial tone and clear writing (Lanham's style)	Either overly casual or overly academic/formal and overblown.
Ethos	-conveys that a credible, reliable author stands behind this essay (this is affected by typos, spelling, punctuation and grammar, etc.)–follows the required format: MLA in-text citation	-is full of technical errors, does not include a citation of sources or does not cite them correctly or consistently-does not follow the required format